

NOTE: This disposition is nonprecedential.

**United States Court of Appeals  
for the Federal Circuit**

---

**DRAGON INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY, LLC,**  
*Plaintiff-Appellant*

v.

**APPLE INC., AT&T SERVICES, INC., CHARTER  
COMMUNICATIONS, INC., COMCAST CABLE  
COMMUNICATIONS, LLC, COX  
COMMUNICATIONS, INC., DIRECTV, LLC, DISH  
NETWORK LLC, SIRIUS XM RADIO INC., TIME  
WARNER CABLE INC., VERIZON  
COMMUNICATIONS, INC.,**  
*Defendants-Appellees*

---

2016-2186, 2016-2453, 2016-2454, 2016-2456, 2016-2459,  
2016-2460, 2016-2461, 2016-2462, 2016-2463, 2016-2464

---

Appeals from the United States District Court for the  
District of Delaware in Nos. 1:13-cv-02058-RGA, 1:13-cv-  
02061-RGA, 1:13-cv-02062-RGA, 1:13-cv-02063-RGA,  
1:13-cv-02064-RGA, 1:13-cv-02065-RGA, 1:13-cv-02066-  
RGA, 1:13-cv-02067-RGA, 1:13-cv-02068-RGA, 1:13-cv-  
02069-RGA, Judge Richard G. Andrews.

---

Decided: November 1, 2017

---

LEI MEI, Mei & Mark LLP, Washington, DC, argued for plaintiff-appellant. Also represented by LAURENCE M. SANDELL.

MICHAEL JAY, Boies, Schiller & Flexner LLP, Santa Monica, CA, argued for defendant-appellee Apple Inc. Also represented by NANDAN PADMANABHAN.

MICHAEL HAWES., Baker Botts LLP, Houston, TX, argued for defendants-appellees AT&T Services, Inc., DISH Network LLC, DirecTV, LLC. Defendant-appellee AT&T Services, Inc. also represented by MICHELLE JACOBSON EBER, ROGER FULGHUM; BRYANT C. BOREN, JR., Palo Alto, CA. Defendant-appellee DISH Network LLC also represented by BRADLEY BOWLING, ALI DHANANI, MICHAEL SHERBY; GEORGE HOPKINS GUY, III, Palo Alto, CA; JAMIE ROY LYNN, Washington, DC. Defendant-appellee DirecTV, LLC also represented by KEVIN GERARD MCBRIDE, Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld, LLP, Irvine, CA; JOHN WITTENZELLER, Philadelphia, PA.

MICHAEL MARTIN MURRAY, Winston & Strawn LLP, New York, NY, argued for defendants-appellees Charter Communications, Inc., Comcast Cable Communications, LLC, Cox Communications, Inc., Time Warner Cable Inc., Verizon Communications, Inc. Also represented by MICHAEL LOUIS BRODY, Chicago, IL; GEOFFREY P. EATON, Washington, DC.

MARK BAGHDASSARIAN, Kramer Levin Naftalis & Frankel LLP, New York, NY, argued for defendant-appellee Sirius XM Radio Inc. Also represented by SHANNON H. HEDVAT.

---

Before MOORE, MAYER, and STOLL, *Circuit Judges*.

STOLL, *Circuit Judge*.

Dragon Intellectual Property appeals the district court's Final Judgments entered pursuant to the parties' stipulations of noninfringement of claims 1–4, 8, and 10 of U.S. Patent No. 5,930,444. Our decision today in a related case, *Dragon Intellectual Property, LLC v. DISH Network LLC et al.*, Nos. 2016-2468, -2492, affirms the Patent Trial and Appeal Board's determination that claims 1–4, 7–10, 13, and 14 of the '444 patent are invalid. Accordingly, we dismiss this appeal as moot.

**DISMISSED AS MOOT**

COSTS

No costs.